



1 Evaluation of Alternatives

Table 1: Evaluation of Alternatives (Per the Draft Land Use Concept Options, dated June 7, 2022)

Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
Built Environment					
Transportation	Potential to improve existing and future traffic congestion and level of service on the existing road network surrounding the Secondary Plan Study Area.	Lowest transportation impacts as there would be no additional trip generation if the Secondary Plan Study Area is not developed. Growth in traffic congestion would be based on growth in the Township as a whole.	 Site-generated traffic will be distributed between four accesses: three from County Road 6 and one from County Road 23. Access to County Road 23 will offset some site-generated traffic to and from County Road 6. 	 Site-generated traffic will be distributed between three access points from County Road 6. All site-generated traffic will interact with County Road 6 intersections. 	 Site-generated traffic will be distributed between three access points from County Road 6. All site-generated traffic will interact with County Road 6 intersections.
	Potential for new transit servicing opportunities and expansion of the existing Kingston Transit network in Amherstview.	No impacts. Existing Kingston Transit service into Amherstview provides service to existing urban area.	 The extension of Route 10 service to County Road 6 with stops at Amherst Drive and Kildare Avenue will provide 400 m (5 min) walking distance to some of the proposed Residential development. The extension of transit service into the Secondary Plan Study Area will be required to serve all residential areas. A transit extension to the north would be required to serve High 	 The extension of Route 10 service to County Road 6 with stops at Amherst Drive and Kildare Avenue will provide 400 m (5 min) walking distance to some of the proposed Residential development. The extension of transit service into the Secondary Plan Study Area will be required to serve all Residential areas. 	The extension of Route 10 service to County Road 6 with stops at Amherst Drive and Kildare Avenue will provide 400 m (5 min) walking distance to all Low Density Residential and most of Medium Density Residential development. A transit extension to the north would be required to serve High Density Residential and Commercial areas.





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
			Density Residential and Commercial areas.	A transit extension to the north would be required to serve High Density Residential and Commercial areas.	
Active Transportation (AT)	Potential to incorporate active transportation (AT) facilities for walking and cycling.	Multi-use pathway (MUP) along County Road 6 is planned outside of the Secondary Plan Study Area and will provide an AT connection between Amherst Drive MUP and Waterfront	The proposed road network will provide connections to County Road 6 and Amherst Drive AT facilities.	The proposed road network will provide connections to County Road 6 and Amherst Drive AT facilities.	The proposed road network will provide connections to County Road 6 and Amherst Drive AT facilities.
		Trail.			
	Potential for opportunities to create active transportation linkages to Parrott's Bay Conservation Area, Loyalist East Business Park, and adjacent communities.	No opportunities for new linkages. All AT connections to/from the west are via County Road 23 or Bath Road.	 AT connections are provided from the Secondary Plan Study Area to Parrott's Bay. The connection is continuous from Amherst Drive. The new north intersection at County Road 23 provides opportunity for an AT crossing to Loyalist East Business Park. 	 AT connections are provided from the Secondary Plan Study Area to Parrott's Bay. The connection is continuous from Amherst Drive. A midblock crossing would be required for access between the Secondary Plan Study Area and Loyalist East Business Park. 	 AT connections are provided from the Secondary Plan Study Area to Parrott's Bay. The connection is continuous from Amherst Drive. A midblock crossing would be required for access between the Secondary Plan Study Area and Loyalist East Business Park.





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
Open Space / Parks	Ability to meet the target for new Neighbourhood Parks (parkland to be developed for active and passive recreation uses) in new planning areas set out in the Loyalist Township Parks and Recreation Master Plan (June 26, 2017) – 2.5 ha/population = 6.05 hectares	Unable to evaluate as the Study Area if not further developed would not constitute a "new planning area". There are no existing parks for passive and active recreation uses within the	7.11 ha of parks/open space is proposed, which exceeds the 6.05 ha target.	6.49 ha of parks/open space proposed, which exceeds the 6.05 ha target.	6.54 ha of parks/open space proposed, which exceeds the 6.05 ha target.
	required.	Study Area.			
	Ability to meet the location criteria for new Neighbourhood Parks (parkland to be developed for active and passive recreation uses) in new planning areas set out in the Loyalist Township Parks and Recreation Master Plan (June 26, 2017): Planned and designed central to the neighbourhood as a focal point; Located with frontage on local or collector roads where possible. avoid crossing of arterial roads; Connected to other parks and destinations by walkways, trails, sidewalks; and may be located with an elementary school for shared use	Unable to evaluate as the Study Area if not further developed would not constitute a "new planning area". There are no existing parks for passive and active recreation uses within the Study Area.	 Parks/open space proposed in four locations some with frontage on Proposed Collector Roads. One park/open space is adjacent to the proposed multi-use path network. Two parks/open space blocks are adjacent to the stormwater management facilities. Park/open space proposed adjacent to school block. 	 Parks/open space proposed in five locations, four of which have frontage on Proposed Collector Roads. Two parks/open space blocks are adjacent to the proposed multi-use path network. Park/open space proposed adjacent to school block. Park/open space block proposed adjacent to Highway Commercial uses, which may be undesirable in terms of land use compatibility. 	 Parks/open space proposed in three locations. Park/open space block proposed adjacent to school block and central to the Study Area. Larger park/open space proposed south of Kildare Avenue extension, with connection to proposed multiuse path network.
	opportunities				
Infrastructure Servicing	Effects on the existing stormwater, water and sanitary sewer facilities and systems.	Existing water/sanitary systems will not be impacted.	The establishment of new watermain distribution piping will provide improvements to the existing system surrounding the	The establishment of new watermain distribution piping will provide improvements to the existing system surrounding the	The establishment of new watermain distribution piping will provide improvements to the





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
		Large land requirements are currently active for stormwater management (SWM) in the existing conditions for Edgewood Municipal Drain and Lost Creek Watersheds.	 area after looping. This includes the Loyalist East Business Park. SWM facilities will mitigate impacts due to severe rainfall for both the Edgewood Road Municipal Drain and Lost Creek watershed areas. Existing sanitary collection systems will be impacted, and capacity constraints may be mitigated; however, this option will require a new dedicated pumping station facility. 	 area after looping. Watermain looping may extend to Highway 33. SWM facilities will mitigate impacts due to severe rainfall for both the Edgewood Road Municipal Drain and Lost Creek watershed areas. Existing sanitary collection systems will be impacted, and capacity constraints may be mitigated; however, this option will require a new dedicated pumping station facility. 	 existing system surrounding the area along County Road 6. SWM facilities will mitigate impacts due to severe rainfall for both the Edgewood Road Municipal Drain and Lost Creek watershed areas. Existing sanitary collection systems will be impacted, and capacity constraints may be mitigated through additional connections to existing sewers. A new pumping station facility would not be required until late phase development.
	Potential for opportunities for connection to existing services and utilities.	No opportunities to connect to existing services and utilities.	The establishment of a new collector to Taylor Kidd Boulevard may provide direct watermain access for looping to the Loyalist East Business Park.	The development of properties to the south of Amherst Drive with a new collector will require further watermain looping connections to Highway 33 and piping to service this option.	A direct connection to sanitary sewers across from Country Road 6 is possible under this option and reduces the requirement for new pumping station facilities in the short term to support development.





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
Social / Cultural Envir	ronment				
Land Use	Ability to achieve consistency with the Provincial Policy Statement, 2020 and the Adopted Loyalist Township Official Plan (Adopted September 25, 2021).	The Amherstview settlement area currently does not have sufficient residential-designated land to accommodate growth for a 25-year planning horizon to 2046 as required by the PPS,	 Options 1, 2, and 3 would see the provision of adequate land in the Study Area as part of the Secondary Plan for a year planning horizon to 2046 and would support the maintaining of a 15-year supply of lands designated and available for residential development. 		
		2046 as required by the PPS, 2020.			
	Ability to accommodate the 2046 population, housing, and commercial employment lands needs forecasts in the Growth Management Report (July 2021).	The existing condition (i.e. residential development, servicing) in the Study Area is unable to accommodate future growth and development in Amherstview	All options meet the residential and	I commercial employment land needs set	out in the Growth Management Report.
		West for the required 25-year planning horizon to 2046.			
	Impacts on existing residential neighbourhoods within and adjacent to the Study Area, and considerations of land use compatibility.	No impact to existing residential neighbourhoods within and adjacent to the Study Area if no development occurs.	Proposed land uses sited away from and existing built-up area of Amher	m existing residential properties within the striew.	e Study Area; parallel to County Road 6
				st of County Road 6 and in close proximit dential areas at Walden Ponds Drive.	y to proposed Medium and High Density
	Ability to meet the Limestone District School Board's siting requirements for a new school and incorporate a future	No opportunities for the future siting of a school block	2.18 ha school block proposed with frontage on Proposed	2.07 ha school block proposed with frontage on Amherst Drive extension.	2 ha school block proposed with frontage on Amherst Drive





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
	school block (2 ha; 5 acres) to serve the future community of Amherstview West.		Collector Road and County Road 6. School block has frontage on a proposed Urban Collector road and County Road, and is located adjacent to proposed multi-use path network.	 Portion of school block located within limits of Edgewood municipal drain. School block has frontage on a proposed Urban Collector road, and is located adjacent to proposed multi-use path network. 	 extension, with close proximity to County Road 6/Amherst Drive. School block has frontage on a proposed Urban Collector road. School block has frontage on a proposed Urban Collector road, and is located adjacent to proposed multi-use path network.
	Minimization of future land acquisition by Loyalist Township to provide for public infrastructure to support development of the Secondary Plan Study Area.	Future land acquisition by Loyalist Township not required if future development does not occur.	Moderate amount of private land impacted by public infrastructure (e.g., collector road). North-south collector road is located on Township land.	Largest amount of private land impacted by public infrastructure (e.g., collector road).	 Minimizes impacts on private property due to public infrastructure requirements. More compact form of development has the potential to minimize footprint of SWM features.
Archaeological Resources	Effect on potential archaeological resources, including presence of areas with archaeological potential affected.	No development impacts to the area will result in no potential impacts to archaeological resources.	Largest area of impact, which has the highest potential to impact potential archaeological resources.	Moderate area of impact, which has moderate potential to impact potential archaeological resources.	Smallest area of impact, which has the lowest potential to impact potential archaeological resources.
Cultural Heritage	Effect on cultural heritage landscapes and built heritage resources.	There will be no potential impacts to built heritage	Minor potential vibration impacts due to proximity of multi-use path	No impacts anticipated from proposed collectors or multi-use paths due to sufficient distance	No impacts anticipated from proposed collectors or multi-use paths due to sufficient distance





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
		resources and cultural heritage landscapes.	 to the identified heritage attributes for 4661 Bath Road. No anticipated impacts to built heritage resources and cultural heritage landscapes from proposed land uses. 	from identified heritage attributes for 4661 Bath Road, built heritage resources and cultural heritage landscapes.	from identified heritage attributes for 4661 Bath Road, built heritage resources and cultural heritage landscapes.
Natural Environment					
Terrestrial Environment	Effects on terrestrial environment, including habitat, tree removal, and species at risk.	No development will result in no impacts to the terrestrial environment (including habitat, tree removal, and species at risk)	 This option has the highest level of impact on the terrestrial environment as the proposed collector road to the north transects the High Constraint – Natural Environment Area. This option has the largest area of impact due to the size of the residential and commercial development footprint. 	 This option has a moderate level of impact on the terrestrial environment as the proposed collector road avoids the High Constraint – Natural Environment Area but still allows for a larger development footprint compared to Option 3, thereby impacting more of the surrounding terrestrial environment. This option has a moderate area of impact due to the size of the residential and commercial development footprint. 	 This option has the lowest level of impact on the terrestrial environment compared to Options 1 and 2. The footprint of the proposed collector road is minimized compared to Option 1 and 2 and avoids the High Constraints – Natural Environment Area. This option has the lowest residential and commercial footprint resulting in lower impacts to the surrounding terrestrial environment when compared to Options 1 and 2.





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
	Effects on linkages to existing Natural Heritage Features, including significant woodlands, valleylands, wetlands, and watercourses, and Parrott's Bay Conservation Area.	No development will result in no impacts to the Natural Heritage Features and the existing habitat / linkages can remain intact without the need for further habitat enhancement measures.	This option has the highest level of impact on habitat and linkage features as the proposed collector road that extends to the north may further inhibit wildlife connectivity to Natural Heritage Features.	This option has a moderate level of impact on habitat and linkage features as the proposed collector road is removed from the High Constraint – Natural Environment Area, thereby allowing for habitat enhancement opportunities to a greater extent as existing linkage features can be retained.	 This option has the lowest level of impact on the connectivity to Natural Heritage Features compared to Option 1 and 2. The footprint of the proposed collector road is relatively smaller compared to Option 1 and 2 and avoids the areas identified as linkage features. Areas surrounding the High Constraints – Natural Environment Area can be retained and creates opportunities to further enhance habitat and existing linkage features.
Aquatic Environment	Effects on aquatic environment, including habitat, water quality, and species at risk.	No development will result in no impacts to the aquatic environment (including habitat, water quality, and species at risk).	This option has the highest level of impact on the aquatic environment as the proposed collector road to the north will need to cross a watercourse feature and High Constraint lands.	This option has a moderate level of impact on the aquatic environment as the proposed collector road avoids the watercourse feature and High Constraint lands.	This option has a moderate level of impact on the aquatic environment as the proposed collector road avoids the watercourse feature and High Constraint lands.
Water Quality and Quantity Controls	Water quality enhancements resulting from stormwater management (SWM) measures.	The current conditions include more pervious area of land and depression storage. There are lower requirements	New SWM facilities will mitigate impacts due to severe rainfall for both the Edgewood Road Municipal Drain and Lost Creek.	New SWM facilities will mitigate impacts due to severe rainfall for both the Edgewood Road Municipal Drain and Lost Creek.	New SWM facilities will mitigate impacts due to severe rainfall for both the Edgewood Road Municipal Drain and Lost Creek.





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
		to store/treat stormwater during major storm events.	 There are opportunities for quality enhancement of stormwater with new facilities and new quantity controls may decrease the overall generation of runoff to receiving bodies. This option includes a watercourse crossing. Lost Creek conveyance may be impacted from infill. 	There are opportunities for quality enhancement of stormwater with new facilities and new quantity controls may decrease the overall generation of runoff to receiving bodies.	 There are opportunities for quality enhancement of stormwater with new facilities and new quantity controls may decrease the overall generation of runoff to receiving bodies. This option does not include collector roads which are adjacent to SWM facilities in the Edgewood Municipal Drain Catchment area, therefore the establishment of new ditches/swales may be required with greater land requirements.
Technical Considerati	ions	'			
Design and Function	Ability to address Problem Opportunity Statement.	Does not address the Problem Opportunity	All options address the Problem Op	portunity Statement for growth developn	nent in the Secondary Plan Study Area.
	Statement.	Statement.			
	Addresses recommendations of Loyalist Township's Infrastructure Master Plan (IMP) (2022) and provides opportunity to coordinate future infrastructure works.	Provides limited to no opportunity to support recommendations from the IMP.	Provides indirect and direct opportunities including improvements to transportation connectivity, transit expansion and servicing upgrades along the boundary of the servicing area.	Provides indirect and direct opportunities including improvements to transportation connectivity, transit expansion and servicing upgrades along the boundary of the servicing area.	 Provides indirect and direct opportunities including improvements to transportation connectivity, transit expansion and servicing upgrades along the boundary of the servicing area. Provides direct opportunities to connect to the infrastructure across





Ranking	Most Preferred = 1	Less Preferred = 2	Not Preferred = 3		
Evaluation Criteria	Indicator	Do Nothing	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
					County Road 6 to reduce requirements for additional pumping stations for sanitary servicing.
	Review of existing geology and hydrogeology opportunities and constraints.	Provides limited to no opportunity	Each new development provides an opp topography.	portunity to characterize and minimize the	impacts of observed or apparent Karst
	Constraints.				
	Ability to address maintenance and access concerns.	Provides limited to no opportunity.	 Provides the greatest number of access options and flexibility with new collector roads. 	 Provides many access options and flexibility with new collector roads. 	Provides many access options and flexibility with new collector roads.
			The installation of a new collector road watercourse crossing will require additional maintenance.	This option includes the greatest amount of new roadway to be maintained.	
	Potential to implement climate change and infrastructure resiliency per the direction in the ResiLienT Loyalist Township	Provides limited opportunity, subject to working with existing landowners.	Provides an opportunity for Loyalist Tow objectives and goals identified in the Res	nship to plan for future development in a siLienT CAP.	n efficient manner and achieve the
Climate Action Plan (2020).		existing landowners.			
	Evaluation of construction feasibility.	Not applicable, as the "Do Nothing" option does not involve construction.	Higher complexity due to new water crossing.	Will require a new pumping station to facilitate development in earlier phases.	Lower complexity as a new pumping station may not be required in initial phase of development.





